

Summary of Discussion
Broward County Charter Review Commission
Public Safety Subcommittee Meeting
Thursday, September 27, 2007
Broward County Main Library
1:00 PM – 2:30 PM

Members Present:

Dr. Mark Lieberman, Chair
Commissioner Hayward Benson
Ms. H.K. "Petey" Kaletta
Commissioner Ted Mena
Mr. Wil Trower

Members Absent:

Mayor Debby Eisinger, Vice Chair
Ms. Maggie Davidson

Others Attending:

Mr. Joe Benavides, President of Broward County Council of Professional Firefighters
Mark Curran, City of Coral Springs
Deputy Chief Rick Earle, Broward Sheriff's Office, Fire Rescue
Chedley Etienne, Administrative Assistant, CRC
Chief of Police Duncan Foster, City of Coral Springs
Yolanda Grooms, Administrative Specialist, CRC
Maria Gross, Assistant Director, CRC
Phyllis A. King, PKING Consulting
Ralph Marrinson, Chair of the Emergency Services Council
Bruce Moeller, Fire Chief, City of Sunrise
Chief Kenneth Pachnek, Lauderhill Police Department
Chief John Picarello, Pembroke Pines Fire Department
Chief David Raines, Lighthouse Point Fire Department
Cheryl Rashon, Broward County Medical Examiner / Trauma
Hazelle Rogers, CRC Vice-Chair
Michael Schloss, Esq., Williams, Wilson Sexton, PA.

Chief Daniel Sullivan, Hallandale Beach Fire Rescue
Patricia G. West, Executive Director, CRC
Mel Wilson, Esq., Special Counsel

(A copy of the sign-in sheets identifying those present is filed with the supplemental papers to the summary of this Subcommittee Meeting.)

A meeting of the Broward County Charter Review Public Safety Subcommittee "Committee," "Subcommittee," or "PSSC," was held at 1:00pm, on Thursday, September 27, 2007 at the Main Library, Bienes Conference Room 6th Floor, Fort Lauderdale, FL.

I. Call to Order/Roll Call

The Chair called the meeting to order at 1:14 p.m. and requested the roll call by Phyllis A. King, PKING Consulting, Inc. Upon completion of the roll the Chair recognized the presence of a quorum and opened the floor to discussion of agenda item II.

II. Approval of Summary of Discussion from September 12, 2007 Meeting

Mr. Mena MOTIONED to approve the September 12, 2007 Summary of Discussion with the proposed staff correction of the date in the footer change it from 8/23/07 to 9/12/07, SECONDED by Mr. Benson and the MOTION passed unanimously.

III. Discussion of Revised Proposed Public Safety Subcommittee Resolution Related to:

- a. Regional Public Safety Communication**
- b. Member of Public Safety Council Appointed by County Commission from a Law Enforcement Labor Organization**
- c. Amending Article 11 Reading Prevailing County Ordinance for Minimum Standards**

The Chair asked Mr. Wilson to provide a brief overview of revisions made to the proposed PSSC Resolution.

Mr. Wilson: Good afternoon, at the last meeting the subcommittee considered a resolution that you should have in your agenda packet which is the latest revision. I want to highlight what the revisions are before discussion or comment by the subcommittee. Revision No. 3 deals with 4 changes that you should beware of – First if you turn to what is exhibit A on page 2, at the top of page 2 section 5.03, we were asked by the CRC Vice-Chair to include "*regional*" in the paragraph that deals with Public Safety Communication. It was suggested that it would be substituted for County-wide. So

what we did is – the title now reads, “Broward County Regional Public Safety Communications”. In the very first sentence the word “County-wide” has been removed and the word “Regional” has been added. That sentence now reads, “The County Commission with corporation from municipalities shall establish a regional communication infrastructure for Law Enforcement, Fire, and Emergency Medical Services”; that is what that change does.

We were also asked and the subcommittee also voted to delete in the second sentence the word “the” in front of communication. Again for those of you who are following this, this is section 5.03 of the revised resolution. On page 2, we were asked to delete the word “the” in front of the word “communication”, but when we looked at it closer the lineation of those words would not make the sentence grammatically correct. In addition to that, the reference language, the word “the” was also included in the first sentence as well as the – or at least the word “a” was included in the first sentence; that language was included in the third sentence. I believe Commissioner Trower brought this up about the previous deletion from the Charter of the words, element of the communication infrastructure which is contained in the second sentence as you see it there, so to avoid the confusion and to make the sentence grammatically correct we did not delete the word “the”, but we went back to the existing Charter language. What you see in that paragraph other than the three words “Regional and Law Enforcement” in the first sentence, is identical to what the Charter currently provides or how the Charter currently reads.

Mr. Mena asked Mr. Wilson if the word “Regional” is the only change in the proposed resolution language.

Mr. Wilson: That is correct, and Law Enforcement from the subcommittee’s previous decision.

Mr. Benson requested an explanation for adding the word regional. He explained that unless the implication is to work with the adjoining Counties (Miami-Dade and Palm Beach); it gives the impression that it is designed to move in that direction, and if it is designed to move in that direction, that is fine.

Ms. West replied that there has been discussion toward focusing the County as a regional government; that region is within Broward County. She added that the County needs to function as a region as a whole, looking at the big issues. She advised that the AGSC will come forward with a policy statement that says that Broward County will be a regional government.

Mr. Wilson: The Director is correct – I think they had some discussion with the Vice-Chair and that is the source of the recommendation. The other point I would add is, I believe his group or organization has the word “regional” in its language.

Mr. Benson clarified that regional means Broward County-wide.

Ms. West explained that this has been the focus in other subcommittees; there will be a regional policy statement brought forth from one of the subcommittee’s which states that, Broward County needs to focus on regionalism within Broward County.

Mr. Trower agreed with Mr. Benson’s concern that regionalism is being looked at more specifically, regarding the tri-county area. He suggested that the language should be as clear and succinct as possible in order to go to the full CRC and the voters, and that maybe there is another term that might be considered.

The Chair asked if the change which is being discussed was voted on at a previous meeting.

Ms. West responded no.

The Chair suggested tabling the issue of the word “regionalism” for now and the subcommittee will readdress it later in the meeting. He requested Mr. Wilson continue.

Mr. Wilson: If we continue on to page 3, at the last meeting the subcommittee asked that we look at language that would add the 13th member to the Public Safety Council as we are calling it; that would be from a prevailing Law Enforcement Labor organization in Broward County. While you may be able to do that, we had some difficulty with how that decision would be made and whether or not there should be Charter language included. What we have provided on page 3, paragraph 13 is, “One member shall be appointed by the County Commission from a Law Enforcement Labor organization within Broward County”. That is just a recommendation that would say that the County Commission would appoint that person from a Labor Organization, or the proposed PSC could decide someone else should appoint that individual. One of the problems is that you have the PBA and you have the FOP organizations – and within Broward you even have – I think we saw about 14 different FOP organizations that are registered as Legal entities. One suggestion is to have the County Commission make that determination without putting it in the Charter, which one is the prevailing or the biggest or the largest organization – and that is just a suggestion in that regard.

For a couple of meetings, Mr. Trower has been asking to go ahead and put in this particular resolution. The fact that if minimum standards were to become part of the Charter and those

minimum standards are recommended to the County Commission, the County Commission in its wisdom should decide whether to pass some Ordinance that deals with minimum standards. We have already had language in paragraph E on page 3 that says which Ordinance would prevail. We simply added that in Article 11. Article 11 basically says that the Municipal Ordinance shall not be affected by any County Ordinances and then it provides 2 exceptions. We just simply added another exception that reads, "Sets with the exception of minimum standards that identify the desired level of services for Fire Protection and Emergency Medical Services"; those are the changes that were made. We also provided in the packet a couple of Ordinances in Chapter 3 which is called the Emergency Medical Services and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation Services, as well as Article 5 which deals with Section 15, which is the Broward Regional Emergency Medical Services Council. That is the EMS Council that addresses some of the same issues that this Committee has been discussing with respect to minimum standards. They address standards and level of service on a much broader scale, and we do have a representative of the Chair here today. That Committee also has about 50 members according to the Ordinance.

The Chair Introduced the Ralph Marrinson, Chairman of the Broward County EMS Council.

Mr. Marrinson: Good Afternoon, thank you very much for allowing me to take some time with you all. Let me be very clear that the EMS Council has not taken a formal position on this moving document. I am going to be speaking as the Chair without a vote or any action to this document. Number 1 – I think you all need a little background. Many years ago, the EMS in Broward County was provided by a whole list of different providers. We had City providers, we had private providers, we had ambulance services operating our cad stations and it was really not a system. Some of our Cities had some very sophisticated Emergency Medical Systems such as Hollywood. It was recognized that politically, we were not going to be able to have one single provider; we would always have a number of providers; municipal, private, etc. The citizenry in Broward does not have a clue when they have an emergency, what governmental jurisdiction they are under when they are moving around the County. We are also not an Island in that Broward County is mutual aide, and of necessity, works with Miami-Dade both on a regular basis and in a disaster. Palm Beach County, you can't forget Collier County, you can't forget the Coast Guard – so you've got some Federal jurisdiction there, so the need to communicate is very important.

What we did as a Council – we said we want everybody at the table to become part of the solution not part of the problem. Let's not have duplication and let's work together because at that point, the North County providers did not know the South County providers. They had no vehicle to meet each other, there was no commonality; the Labor Union, the private sector, and the public sector; we brought everybody to the table. That is why we have 50 members or something like that. We do by

necessity deal with all the same issues that the existing Fire Rescue Council deals with. Specifically that came about to address communications; we are duplicating doing this. Bear in mind that the State has a set of requirements for EMS providers as a minimum set of standards that we have to comply with. They also operate on a Statewide Communication system of 400 MHz. We in Broward are looking at an enhanced program of 800 MHz, but there are a lot of issues with it that cross over.

Let me deal with the issue of Regional for a minute – let me put a different hat on which is the Chairman of the Regional Business Alliance for Southeast Florida; which is made up of Miami-Dade, Broward, and Palm Beach business groups. We are now working on a thing called the Mega-regions; that is expanding our region to include Monroe, Martin, St. Lucie, and Indian River. The Orlando surrounding, there are 9 Counties in the greater Orlando area as part of the mega-region. The Tampa Bay partnership – I think there are 13 counties there, and the Jacksonville area has about 4 or 5. The word regional going forward is going to mean something different than it used to mean. It used to mean within Broward County. Now regional by common definition, is almost becoming beyond the walls of just a single County.

[Commissioner Rogers entered at this time 1:37 p.m.]

Mr. Marrinson: I think you need to recognize that I think we need to deal with this; we need to recognize that mutual aid does grow. What I am trying to say is, in business we try to avoid duplication. That's just the way business operates. If I had my druthers, what I would do is operate the EMS Council under an Ordinance, under which we are advisory to the County Commission; the Fire Rescue Council also is advisory. We have communications – they have communications. Our legal Councils are the same. Our staff person, are two different people who work closely together. Most of our membership if it's not exactly identical is close enough, or we can add another 4 or 5 to it and effectuate an even better system in the end. I am advocating putting an X through this thing and shorting the Charter and we will accomplish everything you all want. We've got, for example on a County-wide system basis, medical protocols, the physicians, the hospital base, the provider base, etc. We got together and set up voluntarily, the minimum set of standards and it works. So, if some things work why duplicate it? Why not get smart and get together. That is what I wanted to say. Thank you for the opportunity to speak with you all, and I will be happy to answer any questions.

Mr. Mena asked Mr. Marrinson to be more specific in his recommendation to shorten the Charter.

Mr. Marrinson: The section that deals with the Fire Rescue Council is a duplication of what the Emergency Medical Service Council does. The only thing that is not in there is Law Enforcement. Law Enforcement sits on our Council, but if you start dealing with Homeland Security issues they are

not really Fire, EMS issues per say. I think developing a relationship and having participation – but I do not think for security reasons, national security, etc.; all of that can be on a sharing basis. It can be on a coordinated basis. I am simply saying that the whole section dealing with – I think you may want to consider just recommending the elimination of it, recognizing it as a duplication, and moving on.

Mr. Mena asked Mr. Marrinson if he communicates with the Police and Fire Chiefs through the EMS.

Mr. Marrinson: Yes.

Mr. Mena asked Mr. Marrinson why the Emergency Medical Services Council was not in attendance at earlier PSSC meetings, and if there is a problem with communication between the EMS Council and those service providers.

Mr. Marrinson: It was brought up at our last EMS Council – we were dealing with communications, and what we are finding again in Broward County, is that we have multiples of everything. It became clear to me sitting at that Council meeting as we are talking about the same thing. They say, well the other group is meeting and why do we have two groups here? We are 22 miles, North - South, and we are 14 miles, East – West, let's make some business sense of our community.

Mr. Mena agreed with Mr. Marrinson, and advised that he wished Mr. Marrinson would have appeared before the subcommittee earlier. Mr. Mena expressed his concern regarding minimum standards and the communications infrastructure. He then explained that there may be a need to reconsider some of the proposed items being discussed, if there is already duplication of effort in Broward County.

The Chair stated that the information provided is new to him, and asked Mr. Marrinson if communications and minimum standards are a part of his objectives. The Chair stated that he understood that there were no minimum standards set.

Bruce Moeller: There are federally recommended practices and standards, and there are State Standards within Fire Rescue.

The Chair asked if the proposed minimum standards are on a higher level than what the State requires.

Mr. Marrinson: It can't be less than what the State requires.

Mr. Moeller: I am still waiting to hear what the specific standards are.

Mr. Benson asked if it is possible to create a matrix listing out the entities that the subcommittee is talking about. He suggested that finding out where the redundancies are might assist the subcommittee.

The Chair stated that he believe it might be difficult and asked Mr. Wilson to comment. He advised that as far as minimum standards, the subcommittee is looking for the proposed Public Safety Council to determine what the minimum standards recommendation will be.

Mr. Trower reminded the subcommittee that a listing of all the County Boards was provided by staff. He listed the charges one by one, advising which were taken care of. Mr. Trower stated that it boils down into two issues - 1 being minimum standards, and the other things could potentially be placed under the existing EMS Council.

Mr. Marrinson: We presently have a Committee looking at the existing Ordinance, the make-up, the composition as well as all other aspects. One of the areas that we want to make sure of is that we have our positions covered, so if there are some categories on here that are not directly – There is no problem recommending that the County Commission modify the Ordinance to add whatever seats that are needed.

Mr. Mena stated that at a previous meeting, he suggested that the subcommittee cross out minimum standards. He asked why continue the discussion when the Cities are opposed to putting minimum standards in the Charter; he believes that a lot of time has been wasted.

Mr. Marrinson: We deal with system spraying, disaster service, and communications, etc. The minute you mandate something, the question of who is going to pay for it is raised, you are imposing a rule. By getting the group to voluntarily work together on the medical protocols – there were some systems and policies in there that worked. Given the same opportunity, I think above and beyond State requirements – I think you can finish something in the reality, because if the County comes down and says that “you shall”, then they are going to say who is going to pay. There were some vague medical protocols as I recall, which prompted us to get into that. Our Systems Planning Committee looks at systems. I am saying that there is no effective way of achieving what you want to achieve, and that’s what the intent of this ordinance was when this thing came to be.

Ms. Rogers asked what the membership of the Emergency Medical Service Council is.

Mr. Marrinson 50 people; he went on to read from the list provided on the EMS Council’s document in the subcommittee folders.

Ms. Rogers asked if the Emergency Medical Service Council is a viable body.

Marrinson: I think we can avoid duplication, and I think that would parallel what they are doing with Airport efficiency. Why should two groups be doing the same thing – I don't know how else to explain it.

Ms. Rogers asked if BSO and the Fire Chiefs Association are on the EMS Board.

Mr. Marrinson: Yes, County Police, Municipal Police, and County Fire, they all work together. When these vacancies come up – someone leaves, someone retires, or whatever, it comes from within.

Ms. Rogers asked Mr. Marrinson if the EMS Board was created by County Ordinance.

Mr. Marrinson: Correct, it was about 30 or 35 years ago.

Ms. Roger pointed out that even with that EMS Board in place the Charter was amended to include a Fire Rescue Council.

Mr. Marrinson: Let me say – I do not know how to word it.

Ms. Rogers stated that the subcommittee is figuring that something is wrong with both structures, hence the recommendation from the MESC.

Marrinson: I am saying that the problem is better solved by having one group where everybody is added and no one is left out.

Ms. Rogers asked Mr. Marrinson if it wouldn't be better for the CRC to dissolve the EMS Council and put in place the Council that the PSSC is recommending.

Mr. Marrinson: Why muddy up a Charter when this can be done by ordinance?

Ms. Rogers asked Mr. Marrinson if he is recommending that the PSSC take the Fire Rescue Council out of the Charter.

Mr. Marrinson: That is what I am saying.

Mr. Joe Benavides: I have known the Board for a very long time. I can tell you personally, I do not believe that some of them have the knowledge and understanding of full Fire Rescue Sheriff's delivery system nor have they ever gone to actually find out what the services are. The reality is in my opinion, if this board was doing their job and they can get all 50 people on the same page at the

same time, we would not be here today. The reality is, the boards that you are trying to makeup are those Men and Women in the field. We have started this from the white paper, the blue paper, the EMS Committee, and the Fire Rescue Task Force. These types of Committees have been proposed to produce one service County-wide. Again, I respect the fact all these men and women over the past 30 years have tried to deliver something and they have, the reality is there are standards for Fire Fighters – there are state standards. There are all these different standards, but the reality is Broward County should not have similar standards within its own County Board. I can tell you, I know there are a lot of people that would like to Sunset this Committee and I know there's a lot of people that would like to have this discussion go on for the next 20 years. But the true reality is, Fire and Police need a standard response protocol County-wide where there are no similarities. I believe a lot of people tried to do a lot of things and I can tell you I have been one of them for 25 years. The men and women I represent are clearly here today with this program, to try and put in wording what would guarantee the delivery of similar Fire Rescue Service System County-wide. It does not have to be up here, but certainly can not be down here. The State position for minimum standard is to have one EMT and one Paramedic on a truck. The facts are truly by definition; if you go by the national standards of the IAL club, you should have 3 Paramedics on a truck, because 1 has to drive, 1 has to maintain an airway and the other one has to deliver patient care. You are talking about life and death service provisions that we can be here, or we can be there, or be similar. ***I would suggest that if you Sunset this Committee you are not going to achieve that within 5 years.*** I believe that if you do the language and some things develop for funding making everything similar, communications and service delivery, we would be a lot closer in 5 years to being a great system rather than a system that is trying to make some changes that are necessary for the people of Broward County.

Ms. Kaletta advised that she supports what Mr. Benavides stated. She does not want to have different services in West Park from Coral Springs. She believes that each Community needs to have input as to what their different needs and abilities are. Ms. Kaletta advised that she likes the word regional, and suggested that the subcommittee look at Sun-setting the EMS Council. She advised that it might be the way to go.

Mr. Marrinson: Many of you were not here back when there was a decision called the **Monai Decision**. The Monai Decision came down when the County was requiring service to be provided without paying. One of the discussions I remember back then is, if you set a standard, who is going to pay for it. Now when we had the emergency room crisis where the physicians went out – I had every media in the Country sitting in my office – they asked me to describe what my problem is and we said that we are down to 1 or 2 hospitals that can do head trauma, and you know what they said? They said, “You do not have a problem, you’ve got a public expectation issue, you are an urban setting.” It takes a ½ hour to get out to somebody and then a ½ to get back, he said “your system is

Comment [pak1]: Pat, Maria – Please confirm the spelling of Monai.

functioning well,” and he had a hard time seeing our problem because they only had one hospital. I am not aware of any complaints – I have not heard a complaint in a long time.

Cheryl Rashon: I am Sheryl Rashon and I am a Medical Examiner in Tom’s Services Division and I help to maintain EMS Services and their guidelines in the County. Mr. Marrinson is correct, I have not received any complaints in quite a while from municipal or otherwise governmental agencies that provide EMS services. They do come into my office frequently to make other complaints; complaints in the EMS community have drastically decreased in the past ten years.

Mr. Marrinson: I think what we are saying is that the men and women that are providers – folks in your group and the other groups that are out there, are doing a tremendous job for the citizens. Sometimes if things are not broke do not fix them, and this may not be one that is broken. I think you should be very proud of the system that we have in the County.

The Chair asked if there were any questions or comments.

Chief Pachnek: I just want to go back to the term “regional”. It means different things to different people in Law Enforcement, it means something totally different. Since the 911 tragedy it means – the way the federal guidelines have been set – they consist of 4 Counties and that is confusing. I talked with Mr. Carpani, I am not sure he was talking about spreading out to the different Counties; he was looking for more of communicating within the 31 cities within Broward County.

Ms. Rogers advised that she can support Chief Pachnek’s comment; her community talks strongly about response time. She stated that if someone mutually requires that my Firefighters go down to the Port because there was an accident there; would they be able to communicate with everyone else. Everything is different since 9-11 and the major hurricanes.

Chief Duncan Foster: Good afternoon, my name is Duncan Foster I am the Police Chief of the City of Coral Springs and I also sit on Region 7 Task Force First, I would like to applaud your efforts here and what the subcommittee is trying to do as it relates to regionalization. As Chief Pachnek said, that is a term that is used very broadly. You have some different factions that would really work here trying to come to the same conclusion, which is to get interoperability between Law Enforcement, Fire, EMS, and Public Works all different entities that are out there. That being said I am here on behalf of the City of Coral Springs to make sure that any changes that you are thinking of... Realize that there are a unique number of Cities out there that are called Peace House, primary funds of dispatch for lack of a better term. Coral Springs is one of the Cities that do provide dispatch service for not only our Police Department but our Fire, and EMS. We also provide dispatch for the City of Parkland,

++

their Fire and EMS. We are very hesitant to turn over or allow the authority that we have to dispatch our folks, to the County. We have been doing our business now for quite a number of years and have been very successful, so we are very hesitant when we hear the term regionalization. How does that impact what we are first and foremost charged with, in delivering the goods and services to all customers of Coral Springs? We are very hesitant when you talk about these regionalization efforts and allowing the County to come in and change our importance, or utilize frequencies that are paid for by the City of Coral Springs; we have some concerns with that. I read the language here and where it talks about the communications infrastructure for law enforcement, and I had some concerns about that.

Mr. Marrinson: It was mentioned before that the Council has a lot of non-provider members on the Council. These men and women look to the expertise of the individuals that are the providers, and we have worked very closely to make sure we have a good system. I would not want to leave the image that these were just a bunch of bobbing heads, because they are certainly not. They question, they challenge, and they do take that active role. I know for all the years that I have been here I have been very proud to be a member of the Council and continue to be proud. I think that it is a great opportunity for this County to have an effective long range planning and working together body that makes sense.

Mr. Benavides: The comment where it was said that we are not an island and that everybody has expectations. Just 5 years ago, I was in a meeting where we were talking about the Fire Rescue Task Force. A comment was made from an organization – I do not remember the name of the organization. The expectation from that organization that was trying to find funding for the Alligator Alley Station is that people cannot presume that they're going to get an adequate response. Going through Alligator Alley, of course it is like the desert. You have to be aware that you are in a rural community, you may have an expectation that is not acceptable. That discussion was brought out and reality is that is not acceptable the Broward Sheriffs Office put an Airboat unit out there, so the expectation of some people to say we cannot afford or you should not have it is a very poor expectation.

The other issue is UASI (Urban Area Security Initiative) funds. Those funds are supposed to be distributed to Police and Fire. The facts are Firefighters and Police – I do not believe a lot of money has been sent to anyone from that fund. At the end of the day it is a complete circle. This is something that you would have to pay for, but if you put it together, you have a plan and you try to work something different, it would pay for itself and will come back and be a stronger entity. As long

as we allow everybody to say, “I have a better Board” or “I have better principal or philosophy” – and they are not truly the experts or concerned with delivery of those services, i.e. communications and fire services, they should not be there.

There should be a plan that is outlined by the people and then go to the people – but to say that we need to sunset this or do that because there is duplication of services... I go back to the closing statement before; we do have duplication of services and that is why we are in the pickle we are in today. We need to establish something that has the ability to make recommendations, to set minimum standards and then from there we can actually grow a plan that we can fund and would make sense in the future financially. Then, we need to attack the UASI money and all these other things that are out there that we are not getting our fair share.

I look at that exact statement. We have a high expectation, but the facts are we can deliver it and we should deliver it, and even if we could deliver it, we should find a way to try and get it. By us sunsetting this committee and not following up on the recommendations of the experts, we are not doing what we have to do to protect our system the way it should be. So, I just say I believe we can do better. You are charged with doing that. I think this language made sense – it is a new way to move, but the facts are we haven’t moved anywhere as close as we are today to make real change for the future. I think that is what this committee is about, closest unit response based on standards that everybody gets the equal response protocol and that will grow to more.

Ms. Kaletta asked Mr. Marrinson how many members are in attendance at his meetings.

Mr. Marrinson: 30 or 35 some where in that range.

Ms. Kaletta advised that it would only take 19 members to vote.

Mr. Marrinson: You know who really attends – the providers.

The Chair advised that there are 8 minutes remaining for the meeting.

Mr. Mena asked Chief Kerns of Coral Springs if there is a City that does not have at least 2 people on a vehicle.

Chief Kerns: Not that I know of.

Mr. Mena advised that the Cities are meeting the minimum standards.

Chief Kerns: I can only speak for Coral Springs.

A conversation ensued regarding the City of West Park and the potential for a different level of service compared to other municipalities.

Ms. Kaletta expressed concern with the level of service in different cities, and asked if there would be the same level of service when you travel through the different municipalities.

Ms. Rashon: As the regulatory agent for Broward County EMS, yes you would be receiving the same level of care as you would in Coral Springs, West Park, and Southwest Ranches, it matters not. The level of expertise of the EMS providers in this County is extremely high and has been for quite a few years, probably back before I even came to Broward County and Chief Moeller hired me many years ago. Yes, you will be getting the same level of care here, and in most instances there are 2 paramedics at minimum.

Mr. Benson asked if a person in the same incident that Ms. Kaletta is in and that person is serviced by a 3 person truck as opposed to a 2 person truck, he asked would the 3 person truck provide better service.

Ms. Rashon: I would have to say no, it would be the same.

The Chair reminded the subcommittee that the recommendations are due to the full CRC on the 10th of October.

Mr. Trower stated that as far as minimum standards the PSSC was charged to basically evaluate and review minimum standards. He advised that he believes that the subcommittee has already completed that and added that the state requires minimum standards. Mr. Trower recommended that the PSSC drop the discussion of minimum standards and rely on the current programs that are out there, based upon the State standards.

Mr. Mena MOTIONED to extend the meeting, SECONDED by Ms. Kaletta and the MOTION passed unanimously.

Mr. Trower MOTIONED to drop the discussion of minimum standards based upon the fact that we do have State minimum standards in place and being observed by all the agencies in Broward County; Ms. Rogers SECONDED the motion for discussion.

Ms. Rogers inquired about the funds that are available but not accessed, she advised that she is concerned and wishes to know what should be done as a Charter.

Ms. West advised that she does not believe that issue is a Charter issue.

Mr. Marrinson: The fact is Broward County is a donor County, the State of Florida is a donor State, and we have not figured out how to play the game; that is something we all have to do.

The Chair advised that there is a motion on the floor.

Mr. Trower MOTIONED to delete the reference to minimum standards on page 3.

Ms. Kaletta advised that she does not agree with the MOTION.

The Chair advised that he does not see why the subcommittee can not go on to the next step allowing the Public Safety Council to decide the level of services.

Mr. Mena recommended eliminating section D and E.

Mr. Wilson: Just for the record the intent of Section E in article 11 C, was to make it clear because the subcommittee wanted to make sure that whatever came out of any standards, if the County Commission were to pass an ordinance to have impact and effect. E and C were put there primarily because of D, so if you delete D the E, then C will go away as well.

Mr. Benavides: The issue is, the Charter Review goes on the ballot based on your recommendation of the full body's approval. The reality is, the Cities were never going to approve anything like this and have not approved anything like this, that's why we have the similar services. I suggest the vote that you take is the vote that allows the discussion to go ahead so everyone in Broward County will have a [honest](#) decision at the ballot box, rather than a small group of local Commissioners or Administrators.

Mr. Moeller: That is not quite a correct statement. If we put it in the hands of the voters, it would ask the voters whether you want to have another group selected by membership – the membership of 13 members to make recommendations to the County Commission. The real question which will not be on the ballot is, *Should we have the County Commission determine levels of service within individual municipalities?* I am the Fire Chief of my community, I am here representing the Fire Chiefs Association and each of the Fire Chiefs will be faced with not getting our direction on standards and what level of service to provide our community from our Commission, but rather the County Commission. Personally we do not believe that is appropriate for the County Commission to tell individual municipalities what the level of service should be.

The Chair asked Mr. Trower if items E and C were taken out, would that be acceptable.

Mr. Trower suggested eliminating references within the amendment that relate to establishing minimum standards by this Council.

The Chair restated the MOTION on the floor which is that Section 5.04 part D and E as well Article 11 C be eliminated, SECONDED by Mr. Mena.

Commissioner Hayward Benson	Yes
Ms. Maggie Davidson	Absent
Mayor Debby Eisinger	Absent
H.K. Petey Kaletta	No
Dr. Lieberman	No
Commissioner Ted Mena	Yes
Commissioner Hazelle Rogers	No
Mr. Wil Trower	Yes

The MOTION was a tie with the vote of 3:3

The Chair advised that the resolution will move forward as a continued work in progress.

Ms. West reminded the subcommittee that if the PSSC does not finish their work there is still the 19 member Commission that will finish for the subcommittee.

The Chair stated that the subcommittee needs to vote on other agenda items.

Ms. Kaletta MOTIONED to change the word “County-wide” to “Regional” there being no SECOND to the motion, the motion FAILED.

Ms. Kaletta stated that when regional was first discussed there were several comments made. One being that the word regional is now being used across the board with the other subcommittees. She stated that the Transportation subcommittee is utilizing regional with hopes that it will be moved into more regional type attitudes. Ms. Kaletta advised that the word regional is a better word to use for that reason.

Mr. Trower advised that this is confusing, and if it is meant to represent Broward County county-wide as a region, that will be too complicated. He added that if we are going to send this to the voters, it should not be ambiguous; it either has to say regional and mean a certain defined region ,or it says County-wide. He added that – that is his only issue.

Mr. Benson advised that in the Transportation subcommittee there was discussion that there needs to be regionality in the delivery of transportation services.

Mr. Mena recommended leaving the language County-wide and ultimately changing it to regional.

Ms. Rogers advised that there needs to be single subject referendum.

Mr. Marrinson: When I came here, it was my understanding that these things had not been in the approved document going forward, and these were added to be discussed. The underlined material here that is being brought to this meeting as an addition to the document that had been processed, the motion was not to include, and that motion failed 3:3, Now does there need to be a motion to include?

Mr. Wilson: Let me just clarify for the record, the reason why you have a Legislative strike through change is because the text that is in black or is not underlined or crossed through is the original Charter. Several of these provisions have already previously been approved so that the full CRC can understand what all of the changes were as they occurred over the various meetings. That is why you have the Legislative track change, but for those 4 items that I mentioned earlier, is what the purpose of this meeting was and that is why they are on the agenda.

The Chair suggested moving on to the next item.

**Mr. Mena MOTIONED to change the language “One member shall be appointed by the County Commission” to “One member shall be appointed by the Broward County Commission”,
SECONDED by Mr. Benson and the MOTION passed unanimously.**

The Chair asked if there was any further discussion.

IV. Discussion of Bifurcation of Ballot Questions

Tabled until the next meeting

V. Public Comment

None

VI. Adjournment

There being no further discussion the meeting was adjourned a 2:54 p.m. The minutes of this meeting are recorded on CRC-PSSC CD # 9.27.07 (BCGV CTR)